#### Date:

January 19, 2016 and continued on January 28, 2016

# Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

# PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Page 1 of 4

#### **January 19, 2016**

## **Committee Members Present:**

Captain George Livingstone, Commissioner and Committee Chair Jennifer Ferrera-Schmid, Commissioner

#### **Committee Members Absent:**

John Schneider, Commissioner Dave Connolly, Commissioner Port Agent or Representative

#### **Staff Present:**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director Kelly Dolcini, Staff Services Analyst Sigrid Hjelle, Office Technician

# January 28, 2016—Continuation Meeting

# **Committee Members Present:**

Captain George Livingstone, Commissioner and Committee Chair Vice President Dave Connolly, Commissioner Jennifer Ferrera-Schmid, Commissioner

#### **Committee Members Absent:**

John Schneider, Commissioner

#### **Staff Present:**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director Kelly Dolcini, Staff Services Analyst Sigrid Hjelle, Office Technician

#### **Public Present:**

Pete McIsaac, Port Agent (late arrival); San Francisco Bar Pilot (SFBP) Captains Joe Long (Commissioner) and Dave Cvitanovic; Ray Paetzold SFBP Business Director – General Counsel; Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President Mike Jacob; Knute Michael Miller, Past Board President; and Ben DeAlba, Assistant Secretary for Rail and Ports, California State Transportation Agency.

#### 1. Call to order and roll call.

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order at 10:23 a.m., and determined that there wasn't a quorum. He called for a continuation of the meeting until 8:45 a.m. on January 28, 2016.

Date:

January 19, 2016 and continued on January 28, 2016

# Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

# PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Page 2 of 4

MEETING ADJOURNED: JANUARY 19, 2016 AT 10:25 A.M. MEETING RESUMED: JANUARY 28, 2016 AT 8:52 A.M.

# 2. Call to order and roll call.

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order at 8:52 a.m., and confirmed a quorum.

# 3. Review and approval of minutes from the June 19, 2015 meeting.

There was no discussion or edits to the minutes.

**MOTION**: Commissioner Schmid moved to approve the minutes from the meeting held on

June 19, 2015. Commissioner Connolly seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, Connolly and Schmid.

NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

## 4. Review the results of the most recent Retirement Survey sent to pilots in December, 2015.

Staff Services Analyst Dolcini confirmed that the surveys were sent out to licensed pilots in December 2015, 53 responses were received. The one pilot who did not respond has submitted a request for a disability retirement. The survey reflects that 11 pilots are intending to retire by the end of 2018.

The Committee reviewed the latest retirement survey results along with projected pilot retirement data. Chairman Livingstone recapped relevant data including: there currently are 54 licensed pilots; there are eight trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program; two of those trainees may graduate in the next month or two; the Chairman of the Pilot Evaluation Committee recommends no more than eight trainees in the training program at one time, but that there could be some overlap with new trainees since these trainees are conducting observation rides for the first couple of months in the program; that he was surprised by the four retirements at the end of 2015; and that it is, in his opinion, difficult to predict the number of retirements beyond 2017.

Commissioner Long stated that the Committee must balance many unknowns including actual pilot retirements, variability of trainee time in program, ensuring that there is a spot for a trainee when he completes the program, and that the Committee's decision today will likely have an impact on the number of licensed pilots in late 2017 and 2018. Commissioner Schmid added that future need for pilots also must factor in an unknown number of unanticipated pilot disability retirements.

Executive Director Garfinkle added that it is important that trainees not be brought singularly into the program to avoid extra workload by the Pilot Evaluation Committee and for trainees to have a

Date:

January 19, 2016 and continued on January 28, 2016

# Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Page 3 of 4

partner during training. He also confirmed that for some time now, the average time spent in the training program has been approximately 18 months, but the minimum amount of time is 12 months and the maximum amount of time is three years. Port Agent McIsaac stated that trainees for the first three months are principally observing, and that Captain Nyborg, Chairman of the Pilot Evaluation Committee is confident that two trainees are soon to graduate.

Mr. Miller stated that approximately 8-10 years ago, 20 licensees were going to retire in about a four year period, which caused budget problems to have many trainees in the training program at one time, and also caused problems with some pilots not wanting to oversee so many trainees. Commissioner Connolly stated that public safety requires a sufficient number of qualified licensed pilots.

In order to balance funding, retirements, and unforeseen pilot medical retirement events, the Committee determined that it would recommend that the Board enroll two new trainees with a target start date of April 1, 2016. Executive Director Garfinkle and Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated that the training budget for this and next fiscal year will be very tight with eight trainees continuing in the training program.

**MOTION**: Commissioner Connolly moved to recommend to the Board that the Board contract

with two new trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program with a target effective

start date of April 1, 2016.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, Connolly and Schmid.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

4. Assessment of the adequacy in current number of pilots and pilot trainees, projected needs through January 2019, including reviewing the most recent 7 CCR §237(d) data. Develop possible recommendation to the Board regarding contracting with additional pilot trainees for entry into the trainee training program.

This agenda item was discussed concurrently with agenda item 3.

5. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were none.

6. Proposals for additions to next Committee meeting agenda.

Chairman Livingstone stated he would work with staff to schedule the next Pilot Power Committee meeting in July.

# Date: January 19, 2016 and continued on January 28, 2016

# Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

Page 4 of 4

# PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

# 7. Adjournment.

MOTION: Commissioner Connolly moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Schmid

seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, Connolly and Schmid.

NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

**ACTION:** The meeting was adjourned 9:25 a.m.

aeuso

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director